

El-Rusyd

https://ejournal.stitahlussunnah.ac.id/index.php/el-rusyd

An Integrative Approach to Al-Ghazali and Carl Jung in the Psychology of Learning within Islamic Religious Education

Syawaldi¹, Charles¹

¹Universitas Islam Negeri Sjech M. Djamil Djambek Bukittinggi, Indonesia

≥32125008@mhs.uinbukittinggi.ac.id *

Abstract

This study aims to formulate an integrative learning psychology model that unifies Al-Ghazali's methodology of Tazkiyatun Nafs with Carl Jung's Individuation process as a transformative framework for Islamic Religious Education. The research departs from a critique of contemporary Islamic Religious Education, which tends to be predominantly cognitivenormative and therefore fails to cultivate inner transformation and holistic character development in learners. Through a comparative-theoretical literature study, this research analyzes the structural and functional correspondences between Islamic psychological concepts Nafs, Qalb, Ruh, and Tazkiyah and Jungian concepts such as the Shadow, Ego, Collective Unconscious, and the Self. The findings indicate a strong functional equivalence, particularly between Nafs Ammarah and the Shadow, as well as between Qalb and the Self/Depth Unconscious. This synthesis produces the "Tazkiyah-Individuation Learning Psychology Model," which consists of three main stages: Takhalli (purification from psychic inferiority/Shadow), Tahalli (cultivation of akhlaq al-karimah and strengthening of the Ego-Self Axis), and Tajalli (spiritual actualization analogous to Self-Realization). The model offers a procedural framework for Islamic Religious Education curricula to integrate moral development, mental well-being, and spirituality into the learning process. This research concludes that integrating the two theories can bridge methodological gaps in the psychology of religion and provide a robust theoretical foundation for developing holistic character education. However, since this study remains theoretical, further research is needed to empirically examine the model's effectiveness within Islamic Religious Education and psycho-spiritual counseling contexts.

Article Information:

Received October 15, 2025 Revised November 28, 2025 Accepted December 19, 2025

Keywords: Psychology, integrative Islamic education, individuation, Al-Ghazali, Carl Jung

INTRODUCTION

The contemporary world is enveloped by rapid technological advancements and massive globalization; yet, paradoxically, these developments are accompanied by an increasingly alarming moral crisis and psychological conflict. Specifically, Islamic Religious Education faces serious challenges, as reflected in the emergence of extreme acts of terrorism, which often lead scholars to conclude that religious

How to cite: Syawaldi, S., Charles, C. (2025). An Integrative Approach to Al-Ghazali and Carl Jung in the

Psychology of Learning within Islamic Religious Education. El-Rusyd, 10(2), 126-139.

E-ISSN: 2580-0

Published by: The Institute for Research and Community Service

education has failed to instill a comprehensive and inclusive understanding among its adherents (Hanafie & Khojir, 2023). Furthermore, the general education sector has undergone a dramatic shift in orientation from focusing on the pursuit of knowledge (knowledge-oriented) to merely seeking degrees or certificates (certificate-oriented). This shift indicates that Islamic Religious Education has not fully achieved its fundamental goal: producing a generation that not only understands religious doctrine but also embodies genuine religiosity, moral maturity (Fadhil & Sebgag, 2021), and the ability to control unregulated basic psychological impulses Syahwat (desire) and Ghadhab (anger) which Al-Ghazali identifies as fundamental elements in the structure of the human Nafs (Rahmadi, 2022). This systemic failure is rooted in a normative-cognitive approach that neglects the inner psychological dimension, which is the primary determinant of both moral and immoral behavior.

The literature on the psychology of religion presents two streams of thought with significant potential convergence. The first is Islamic psychology, which focuses on inner hierarchy and potential, asserting that Ruh and Qalb constitute the center of consciousness that transcends rational intellectual capacity (Uddin & Irshad, 2022). The second is Jungian analytical psychology, which highlights the central role of religion as a transcendent psychic function in attaining the Self. Jung specifically acknowledges that modern rational thought cannot fully resolve the psychological conflict arising from religious needs, and he believes that religion represents the unconscious and human emotions far better than purely scientific theories (Kermani, 2020). This connection becomes more evident when considering that Jung's concept of the Depth Unconscious which contains innate knowledge of God and instinctive wisdom closely resembles the Islamic conception of the Qalb (Sun & Kim, 2024). This comparison suggests that the Jungian psychological framework, with its recognition of the universality of archetypes and transpersonal dimensions, is fundamentally more compatible with the spiritual framework of Al-Ghazali than other Western psychological schools that strictly center on the Ego or materialism.

Al-Ghazali developed a dynamic model of the Nafs, dividing it into three fundamental components that influence one's psychological condition: 'Agl (intellect), Syahwat (desire), and Ghadhab (anger) (Elzamzamy et al., 2024). A person's spiritual development is measured through stages of the Nafs, beginning with the lowest level, Nafs Ammarah (the soul that commands evil), progressing through Nafs Lawwamah (the self-reproaching soul), and culminating in Nafs Muthma'innah (the tranquil soul) (Trimulyaningsih et al., 2024). In this process, the role of the Qalb is vital, as it functions not merely as a physical organ, but as the spiritual center containing al-nur al-Ilahi (divine light) and Al-Basyirah al-Bathiniyyah (inner vision) that radiates faith. From this perspective, the primary goal of Islamic Religious Education is the perfection of moral character through the education of the *Qalb* and the cultivation of spiritual awareness. The success of Qalb education depends on two essential mechanisms: mujahadah (struggle against the passions) and riyadhah (spiritual training). These mechanisms are manifested through the systematic processes of Takhalli (purification from vices) and Tahalli (adornment with virtues) (Wahid et al., 2025).

Carl Gustav Jung developed a personality theory centered on the complex interaction between the conscious mind (Ego) and the unconscious both personal and collective. Jung's psychic structure includes the Persona (social mask), Ego (center of consciousness), Shadow, and Anima/Animus, which collectively integrate to form the Self. The key process in Jungian psychology is Individuation, a lifelong journey toward psychic wholeness and personality maturity through the harmonious integration of unconscious aspects into consciousness (Abarchah, 2023). Jung believed that the Collective Unconscious contains universal archetypes and, importantly, that all humans share a fundamental spiritual or religious need that is often repressed by modern rational demands (Sun & Kim, 2024). Thus, Individuation is a unique process of self-discovery in which religiosity acts as a transcendent psychic function essential for unifying fragmented inner elements, providing personal and spiritual meaning, and forming an integrated sense of identity (Cherepanov & Morgunov, 2019).

A structural comparative analysis reveals a close functional relationship between the core concepts of both theories. At the level of inferiority, Al-Ghazali's Nafs Ammarah bis Su', the reservoir of base desires and worldly impulses, has functional parallels with Jung's concept of the Shadow. The Shadow is defined as the dark and repressed side of the human self, driven by primal instincts and suppressed due to social norms (Kermani, 2020). Furthermore, the comparison extends to the spiritual center: Qalb (the center of Fitrah and al-nur al-Ilahi) corresponds functionally to Jung's Self or Depth Unconscious, which is believed to contain instinctive wisdom and knowledge of God (M. I. Sari et al., 2023). Both Al-Ghazali and Jung emphasize that the root of psychological and moral problems lies in failure of self-development, caused by neglect, denial, or repression of these inferior aspects (Nafs Ammarah or Shadow), ultimately producing destructive inner conflict.

Although previous studies have demonstrated significant structural similarities between Islamic and Jungian psychology, most have been limited to terminological comparisons (e.g., Nafs versus Ego/Id, Qalb versus Self) (Elzamzamy et al., 2024). The primary limitation is the absence of a truly integrative learning model that offers a practical methodological bridge for Islamic Religious Education practitioners. Contemporary Islamic Religious Education curricula require not only a strong conceptual framework but also clear and structured procedures capable of initiating and guiding students' inner transformation (Wahid et al., 2025). Prior studies have not explicitly mapped the Sufi stages of Takhalli, Tahalli, and Tajalli onto Jung's psychological stages in order to produce an operational cycle for Islamic Religious Education. Therefore, the novelty of this study lies in synthesizing Al-Ghazali's transformative method (Tazkiyah) with Jung's universal psychological aim (Individuation), producing a procedural psycho-spiritual learning framework oriented toward holistic character formation through integrated psychic development (Trimulyaningsih et al., 2024).

Based on the identified limitations in previous studies, the direction of this research must shift from passive philosophical analysis to methodological-application synthesis. This direction leads to the formulation of the "Tazkiyah-Individuation Learning Psychology Framework," which systematically establishes implementation steps for Islamic Religious Education (Sifat et al., 2022). The framework proposes that the Islamic Religious Education curriculum follow a transformative cycle consisting of: identification and recognition of the Shadow/Ammarah, processes of negotiation and self-purification, assimilation of positive qualities, and full selfrealization (Mutholingah & Zain, 2021). This model is designed to empower Islamic Religious Education teachers to function not only as instructors but also as spiritual counselors (Voon et al., 2022). Through this expanded role, teachers can help students explore their interests and talents, discover deeper meaning in religious teachings, and strengthen their mental health, spiritual well-being, and the formation of a unified adolescent identity (Ghani et al., 2024).

The need for a robust psycho-spiritual framework has encouraged various integrative efforts in academic literature, particularly in Islamic guidance and counseling, where Al-Ghazali's perspective is frequently presented as an alternative spiritual counseling approach (Siregar et al., 2024). However, a fundamental dualism persists: Islamic spiritual thought, centered on *Qalb* and *Rub* as the deepest human potentials, versus Western psychology, which predominantly focuses on the Ego and mechanisms of the unconscious (Rothman & Coyle, 2020). Although comparative studies have identified structural correlations for example, equating Nafs with Id/Ego/Superego or linking Jung's Depth Unconscious with the function of the Qalb (Apriyanti et al., 2023). These studies generally stop at conceptual comparison. The most critical gap in the literature lies in operational methodology (Fakhruddin et al., 2025). Al-Ghazali provides a structured transformative method through *Takhalli* and Tahalli, while Jung provides a universal diagnosis and goal. Therefore, a deeper synthesis is required one that explains how classical spiritual methods can be translated and operationalized within a modern psychological framework for application in the Islamic Religious Education curriculum (Sunarno et al., 2022).

This study aims to address the methodological gap identified in the literature by focusing on the unification of these frameworks (Fakhruddin et al., 2025). This aligns with the broader need for interdisciplinary strategies to enhance understanding in areas such as spiritual well-being and moral education. The explicit objective of the study is to identify the conceptual and more importantly methodological points of convergence between Al-Ghazali's self-formation psychology, centered on Tazkiyatun Nafs, and Carl Jung's analytical psychology, centered on the Individuation Process. Al-Ghazali's psychology emphasizes Tazkiyatun Nafs for character formation (Sifat et al., 2022), and his psycho-spiritual counseling theory addresses aspects of nafs, galb, ruh, and 'aql to resolve personal issues and support psycho-spiritual development.

Furthermore, this study aims to formulate an integrative learning psychology model that can serve as a framework for a holistic Islamic Religious Education curriculum. While Al-Ghazali's ideas on Islamic educational curriculum have been shown to be relevant to Islamic Religious Education learning outcomes (Hanafie & Khojir, 2023), the proposed model is designed to emphasize Tazkiyatun Nafs as the core of the educational process, making it a pathway toward achieving psychic wholeness. Al-Ghazali's concept of Tazkiyatun Nafs is increasingly recognized as a fundamental approach to character formation and mental well-being in modern Islamic education, as well as a reflective, introspective, and transformative spiritual practice for deep moral internalization. Through this model, Islamic Religious Education is expected to contribute meaningfully to addressing the contemporary moral crisis by shifting educational focus from merely transferring normative knowledge to fostering inner transformation and purification, particularly through Qalb education as the center of morality. The Islamic path toward health and wholeness involves the purification of the self (al-nass) and the heart (qalb), guided by Al-Ghazali's ethical principles emphasizing spiritual dimensions and purification of the soul.

This study analyzes Al-Ghazali's *Tazkiyatun Nafs* process, which consists of Takhalli (cleansing the soul from blameworthy traits), Tahalli (adorning the soul with praiseworthy traits), and Tajalli (the unveiling of divine presence when the soul becomes purified) (Mutholingah & Zain, 2021). These stages provide practical, structured, and applicable mechanisms that can be considered for operationalizing Jung's Individuation stages specifically, integrating the Shadow and orienting the Ego toward the Self within the context of Islamic Religious Education. The concepts of Takhalli and Tahalli themselves constitute practices for self-improvement and the development of religious personality. Although Al-Ghazali and Jung differ in epistemological foundations, they share a synchronized ultimate goal: the attainment of spiritual perfection, a notion supported by efforts to integrate Islamic teachings with psychological principles.

Jung defines the goal of Individuation as psychic wholeness and personality maturity, whereas Al-Ghazali positions the goal of Tazkiyatun Nafs as the attainment of Nafs Muthma'innah (the tranquil soul) (Trimulyaningsih et al., 2024). Both processes require purification from the distortions of desire (syahwat) that obstruct divine truth, in which Takhalli seeks to purify the self from reprehensible traits and actions through self-discipline (riyadat al-nafs) and inner purification (tazkiyat al-nafs) as a practical framework (Rothman & Coyle, 2020). Thus, if Individuation explains what must be achieved (universal wholeness), Tazkiyatun Nafs explains how it is achieved through Sufi methods compatible with Islamic teachings.

METHODS

The unit of analysis in this theoretical comparative study is focused on psychic and spiritual concepts that are meta-theoretical in nature, rather than on the empirical behavior of research subjects such as individuals or groups of students. The key concepts under analysis include the structural and dynamic dimensions of personality (Rothman & Coyle, 2020). From Al-Ghazali's perspective, the units of analysis consist of the Nafs (with its three levels: Ammarah, Lawwamah, and Mutma'innah), the Qalb (spiritual heart), the Ruh (soul), and the transformative mechanism of Tazkiyatun Nafs. Meanwhile, in Carl Jung's framework, the units of analysis include the Self, the Individuation Process, the Shadow, and the Collective Unconscious (Kermani, 2020). A rigorous analysis is carried out to uncover the latent functions and meanings of each unit, ensuring that the resulting comparison is essential and operational in nature rather than merely a superficial comparison of terminologies. This approach allows the integration framework to attain strong philosophical and psychological validity (Zulkipli et al., 2022).

This study adopts a Theoretical Comparative Library Research design, relying exclusively on books, journals, and academic literature as the primary objects of investigation ('Pandey,' 2025). The approach used is philosophical qualitative analysis, designed to compare two major theoretical frameworks originating from distinct epistemological traditions: Sufi-Islamic tradition and Western Analytical Psychology (Feuillebois-Pierunek, 2017). The main objective of this design is to identify points of functional correlation between the independent variables (Al-Ghazali's theory and Jung's theory) in order to formulate a synthetic dependent variable an innovative integrative learning model. The comparative nature of this design enables the researcher to identify ontological similarities, epistemological differences, and, most importantly, the potential for systematic methodological integration. This design provides a robust and coherent theoretical foundation before the proposed model can be empirically tested in future educational contexts (Minkov et al., 2024).

Data collection in this library-based study is categorized into two major types. Primary sources include foundational works that contain the original concepts of both scholars. For Al-Ghazali, the main primary sources are *Ihya' Ulum al-Din* and Ma'arij Al-Quds Fi Madarij Ma'rifat an-Nafs. For Carl Jung, the primary sources include Man and His Symbols, Aion: Researches into the Phenomenology of the Self, and The Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious (Minkov et al., 2024). Secondary sources consist of indexed academic journals, postgraduate theses, and monographs that specifically discuss interpretations, contemporary relevance, and comparative studies of concepts such as the Nafs, Qalb, Individuation, and the Shadow. The use of primary sources is strongly emphasized to maintain the integrity and accuracy of the original concepts (Fitri et al., 2025; Ningrum & Syafril, 2024; Zalnur et al., 2024). Whereas secondary sources function as comparative validation, offering modern interpretive context and bridging the gap between theological-philosophical language psychological terminology.

The data collection technique employed is systematic documentation, supported by heuristic searching and logical verification of relevant academic literature (Chalhoub et al., 2024). This process involves three stages. First, identifying core conceptual keywords and locating documents that contain in-depth discussions on the interrelations among concepts. Second, categorizing the collected data based on the three main themes that guide the study: Psychic Structure (personality components), Transformative Processes (methodology), and Ultimate Purpose (wholeness/perfection). Third, data extraction is conducted directly by recording definitive quotations, descriptions of mechanisms, and the claimed functions articulated by each scholar. Since this research relies on library study, the validity and reliability of the findings are ensured through the selection of credible sources, consisting of original works and comparative analyses published in academically vetted journals and theses, thereby ensuring a solid theoretical foundation (Christou, 2025).

Data analysis is conducted through an inductive qualitative approach, following three main stages. The first stage is Data Reduction, in which all extracted theoretical information is summarized, filtered, and simplified to focus only on concepts that exhibit the most significant functional correspondence between the two frameworks (Monaro et al., 2022). The second stage is Comparative Content Analysis and Hermeneutics. At this stage, the researcher interprets the deeper meanings (hermeneutics) of key concepts, compares their latent functions, and performs cross-checking (literature triangulation) with secondary findings to verify interpretive accuracy (Alejandro & Zhao, 2024). The final stage is Conceptual Synthesis, in which the comparative findings are integrated into a cohesive theoretical framework, producing a new learning model that can guide practical implementation in the field.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The findings of this study reveal a strong functional correspondence between Al-Ghazali's Nafs Ammārah bi al-Sū' and Carl Jung's concept of the Shadow, both of which represent the inferior psychic domain that must be acknowledged and regulated (Petric, 2023). Functionally, both serve as instinctive sources of destructive potential. Jung asserts that an individual's failure to recognize, acknowledge, and negotiate with the Shadow is the root of psychological disturbances, which may escalate into interpersonal conflict and even broader social dysfunction. Similarly, Al-Ghazali describes the Nafs Ammārah as a "crater of evil" within the body and the "nest of corruption," which, when dominant, destroys one's humanity. Thus, the initial and unavoidable step in both transformative processes Tazkiyatun Nafs and Individuation is an honest self-admission of the inner vice triggered by inferior impulses.

According to Al-Ghazali, Nafs Ammārah bi al-Sū' represents the lowest level of the soul and is incapable of fulfilling the primary purpose of human creation serving God (Trimulyaningsih et al., 2024). This psychic state is entirely dominated by shahwah and ghadhah, excessive desire and anger (Uddin & Irshad, 2022). The Ammārah drives the fulfillment of basic bodily needs such as food, drink, and sexual desire, yet it constantly demands gratification beyond the limits of necessity. Al-Ghazali's characterization of it as a "crater of evil" and "the lair of all depravity" reinforces its position as the representation of inner darkness that drives individuals toward immoral outward and inward actions (Ali et al., 2022). Essentially, Nafs Ammārah is the principal source of moral temptation that must be subdued by the 'Agl and the Qalb.

In contrast, the Shadow in Jungian psychology is an archetype representing the darkest, hidden, repressed, and guilt-laden side of personality, rooted in ancestral animal instincts (Boscaljon, 2024). The Shadow is intensely emotional and primal, often denied or rejected by the Ego for being socially unacceptable. Jung notes that the Shadow is not solely composed of morally blameworthy tendencies; it also contains positive latent qualities such as normal instincts, realistic insight, and creative impulses (Oktavia et al., 2025). Shadow Work, therefore, is essential not only for purifying the negative but also for recovering these hidden positive potentials and

integrating them into consciousness, enabling the personality to become more rounded and whole.

Al-Ghazali's process of *Takhalli* is methodologically identical to Jung's Shadow Work (Wahid et al., 2025). Takhalli, the purification from vices such as envy, ostentation, arrogance, and wrath, constitutes a mandatory step before spiritual growth can occur (Trimulyaningsih et al., 2024). This cleansing requires individuals to consciously confront and acknowledge repressed or denied traits, which is a prerequisite for Jungian Shadow Assimilation. In other words, Jung warns that one must acknowledge the Shadow and enter into a difficult negotiation with it in order to achieve wholeness an interpretation that parallels Al-Ghazali's concept of mujāhadah (inner struggle) against Nafs Ammārah (Paul et al., 2025).

The second major finding shows an essential equivalence between Al-Ghazali's Oalb/Ruh and Jung's Self or Depth Unconscious (Feuillebois-Pierunek, 2017). Both are positioned as the transcendental centers that guide and organize the entire psyche, and both seek perfection or wholeness (Uddin & Irshad, 2022). The Self is the central archetype representing the ultimate goal of Individuation attaining psychic wholeness and personality maturity (Zulkipli et al., 2022). This link is reinforced by literature connecting Jung's Depth Unconscious which is believed to contain instinctive wisdom and knowledge of God to the Islamic concept of the Qalb (Sari et al., 2023). Thus, the ultimate goal of both psychological systems is not merely social adjustment or worldly satisfaction, but holistic and transcendental spiritual realization (Hossain, 2024).

In Al-Ghazali's framework, the Qalb serves as an isthmus connecting the self (ego) with the Ruh (spirit). It is the center of divine consciousness, the seat of fitrah (innate disposition), and the innate sensitivity to right and wrong. The *Qalb* possesses a unique capacity to receive inspiration and emit al-nūr al-Ilāhī (divine light), as well as an inner eye (al-Basīrah al-Batīniyyah), which constitutes the source of faith (Ferhat, 2020). Al-Ghazali holds that the true essence of humanity lies in the soul, and human perfection is achieved through the purification of the Qalb. A sound heart (qalb salīm) inherently promotes virtuous behavior, deters individuals from moral corruption, and continuously guides them toward righteous action. Balancing the roles of Agl (rationality) and *Oalb* (intuition/spiritual heart) is essential for developing the human spirit (Rahmadi, 2022).

For Jung, the Self is the archetype of wholeness and the final outcome of the Individuation Process (Boscaljon, 2024). It represents the harmonious integration of all psychic elements, including the Ego and Shadow, leading to mature personality development (Scalabrini et al., 2022). The Self or Depth Unconscious contains instinctive wisdom capable of guiding and balancing the other parts of the psyche. Jungian literature also notes that this Depth Unconscious contains an innate knowledge of God (Albshkar et al., 2025; Hamzah et al., 2025). In religious art, the psychic unity resulting from the transcendent function is often symbolized as the Mandala, a symbol of wholeness representing self-realization. Jung defines the Self not as an empowered Ego but as a new center of the psyche that encompasses both consciousness and the unconscious (Abdullayeva, 2024).

The synthesis confirms that both the *Qalb* and the Self function as archetypes of transcendental guidance (Kermani, 2020). Jungian psychology aims to open the individual to guidance from the Depth Unconscious, a process that aligns with Al-Ghazali's emphasis on purifying the *Oalb*. By cleansing the *Oalb* from the stains of desire, al-nūr al-Ilāhī illuminates the inner sight, enabling the perception of divine truth while safeguarding the heart from conflict (Breidy, 2025). Thus, both theories converge in asserting that happiness and perfection cannot be measured externally or through worldly pleasures (desires deluded by illusion), but through the inward centering of the purified spiritual core (Rahawarin et al., 2025; Sari et al., 2025).

The most significant claim emerging from this study is the methodological correspondence between the stages of Tazkiyatun Nafs and the primary phases of Jung's Individuation Process (Htay et al., 2025; Rahman et al., 2025). Takhalli (purification from vices) is functionally equivalent to Shadow Assimilation (the initial stage of Individuation), which must be undertaken to cleanse the Nafs Ammārah (Trimulyaningsih et al., 2024). Following Takhalli, the process proceeds to Tahalli (cultivation of virtuous traits), which mirrors the construction of new structures and the strengthening of the Jungian Ego–Self Axis (Sifat et al., 2022). Finally, Tajalli (the unveiling of divine illumination) represents the spiritual attainment synonymous with the realization of the Self wholeness and maturity. This sequence suggests that Al-Ghazali's Tazkiyatun Nafs offers a procedural blueprint for activating the psychic dynamics described by Jung. The phase of Nafs Lammāmah (the reproaching soul) in Al-Ghazali's system functions as a transitional phase, representing the Ego's conflict as it begins to confront the Shadow, before progressing toward Nafs Muṭma'innah.

The proposed model, the Tazkiyah–Individuation Integrative Learning Psychology, formulates a cyclical framework of purification and self-integration for Islamic Religious Education (Fakhruddin et al., 2025). This framework integrates Jungian psychic functions with Al-Ghazali's Sufi stages. The first stage identifies Nafs Ammārah as the Shadow, which must be purified through Takhalli. The second stage involves Nafs Lawwāmah, reflecting the inner conflict experienced by the Ego as it struggles against primal impulses (Hossain, 2024). This is followed by Taḥalli, equivalent to strengthening the Ego–Self Axis through the cultivation of akhlāq alkarīmah. The peak of the process is Tajalli, the realization of the Self, manifested as Nafs Muṭma'innah. This framework is significant because it transforms theoretical descriptive comparisons into a procedural model that can be applied to Islamic Education curriculum design.

Table 1. Integrative Psycho-Spiritual Learning Model

| Al-Ghazali's Components (Tazkiyatun Nafs) | Carl Jung's Components (Individuation) | Instructional Function in Islamic Religious Education | |
|---|---|---|--|
| Nafs Ammārah / Desire / | The Shadow (Inferior | Identification and Regulation | |
| Anger (Syahwat/Ghadhab) | Aspect of the Psyche) | of Primal Instinctual Drives | |
| Takhalli Process | Shadow Assimilation (Initial Phase of Individuation) | Self-Purification (<i>Mujāhadah</i>) from Blameworthy Traits and Repressed Impulses | |
| Tahalli Process | Ego–Self Axis Formation | Development of Virtuous Traits, Personality Stability, and Akhlag al-Karimah | |
| Nafs Muthma'innah/Tajalli | Realization of the Self (Wholeness) | Attainment of Spiritual Peace, Maturity, and <i>Ma'rifah</i> | |

Implementation of an integrative model in Islamic Religious Education should begin with an emphasis on the *Takhalli* phase, which directly incorporates Jungian shadow work. The curriculum action plan must encourage learners to engage in deep introspection not merely to comply with norms, but to honestly acknowledge and identify their "dark side" or reprehensible traits, such as envy (*hasad*), arrogance (*takabbur*), ostentation (*riya*), and anger (*ghadzab*). This approach moves beyond simply suppressing negative impulses. Instead, the technique of *mujahadah* (struggling against the ego), as advocated by al-Ghazali, may be interpreted as a conscious negotiation with the Shadow (Ali et al., 2022). By acknowledging these drives, the destructive potential of the *Nafs Ammarah* can be brought to the surface of awareness and managed, preventing it from evolving into unconscious inner conflict and eventually manifesting as harmful social behavior. Islamic Religious Education must serve as a safe space through spiritual guidance and counseling, enabling students to confront their shadows without judgment.

The Tahalli phase functions as an active process of psychic synthesis, equivalent to the construction of the Jungian Ego-Self Axis. Following the purification achieved through Takhalli, the newly refined personality is filled with virtuous traits (akhlaq al-karimah), which result from a harmonious balance between the 'Aql' (intellect) and the Qalb (spiritual heart). In al-Ghazali's view, personality perfection is realized when the four dimensions Qalb, Rub, Nafs, and 'Agl exist in a state of equilibrium (Apriyanti et al., 2023). Tahalli emphasizes sustained riyadhah (spiritual disciplines) (Sifat et al., 2022). This ensures that good actions (amal salih), derived from beneficial knowledge, are not merely incidental but become stable and enduring character traits. Thus, *Tahalli* is the phase of value internalization, during which the Ego consciously becomes oriented toward and guided by the archetypal Self.

Although the transformative processes of Tazkiyatun Nafs and Individuation demonstrate a close methodological synchrony, it is important to highlight their nuanced differences in ultimate orientation. Jung's objective is psychic wholeness, a discovery of the true self that is universal and psychological in nature (Elzamzamy et al., 2024). In contrast, al-Ghazali's objective extends beyond psychic wholeness toward Ma'rifah (gnosis of God) and Mahabbah (Divine love), representing the transcendental and eschatological dimensions of Islam (Rothman & Coyle, 2020). Integrative Islamic Religious Education employs Jungian frameworks to provide relevant psychological diagnostics and a structured method for universal selfunification. Yet the resulting psychic wholeness is redirected toward Islamic eschatological objectives, making Self-realization not an end in itself but a necessary precondition for attaining Ma'rifah and Divine closeness (Sunarno et al., 2022).

The deepest meaning embedded in this theoretical synthesis is the realization of Dharma Insan, a term used in Jungian discourse to refer to the fulfillment of meaningful human purpose. The process of Individuative Tazkiyah philosophically requires that all worldly affairs including work and learning be conducted in full harmony with the soul so as not to generate internal conflict (Ismail & Haryanto, 2022). By maintaining the clarity of the Qalb through purification and replenishment, individuals are protected from distortions of desire arising from waham (illusory perceptions) of fleeting worldly pleasures (Sari et al., 2023). This interpretation provides a profound solution to issues in Islamic Religious Education that are overly certificate-oriented (Sismanto, 2022). Through internalizing this model, academic and certification achievements are no longer viewed as materialistic objectives detached from the hereafter but rather as instruments for achieving complete *Dharma Insan*, wherein every deed in this world becomes meaningful for the afterlife and fulfilling for the inner self (Engkizar et al., 2023, 2024; Engkizar et al., 2025).

The attainment of Nafs Muthma'innah (the serene and God-approved soul) serves as the highest reflection and indicator that an individual has successfully integrated the Shadow and realized the Self. At this stage, the *Qalb* is fully purified and guided by the Al-Nur al-Ilahiy. Although the present scholarship does not always explicitly reference Al-Nur al-Ilahiy as the direct guide of the Qalb, the concept of the heart as the controller and motivator of bodily action and its role in spirituality and divine knowledge has been widely discussed (Uddin & Irshad, 2022). The methodological implication for Islamic Religious Education is the necessity of curriculum designs that incorporate the assessment and training of spiritual intelligence. Learning activities in the Tajalli phase must facilitate genuine spiritual unveiling. This can be achieved through spiritual mediations such as dhikr (remembrance of God) and tafakkur (contemplation), which aim to open the inner eye (al-Basirah al-Batiniyyah) and internalize religious values, ultimately leading to inner peace and psychological well-being (Thoha et al., 2023). The inner balance attained at this stage naturally manifests in positive social behavior, including increased empathy,

tolerance, and the ability to understand differences qualities essential for spiritually mature and well-rounded character (Acetylena et al., 2024).

Table 1. Conceptual and Methodological Integration in the Tazkiyah–Individuation Model

| Component (Stage) | Al-Ghazali's Concept | Carl Jung's Concept | Psychological Meaning | Implications for Islamic Religious Education |
|---|---|--|---|--|
| Identification of Psychic Inferiority | Nafs Ammārah (dominant impulses of desire and anger) | The Shadow (repressed dark aspects of the self) | Psychic inferiority becomes a source of inner conflict if not acknowledged | Students are guided to recognize their "dark side" through introspection, spiritual counselling, and reflective journaling |
| Purification Stage | Takhalli (mujāhadah; purification from blameworthy traits) | Shadow Work / Shadow Assimilation | Acknowledgment and negotiation with negative impulses | Curriculum provides self-purification activities: self-control practices, moral discussions, and character guidance |
| Value- Internalization Stage | Tahalli (adornment with virtuous character) | Ego–Self Axis Formation (alignment of the Ego with the Self) | Formation of a stable, value- oriented personality structure | Teachers facilitate riyadah, character habituation, character-building programs, and life-purpose coaching |
| Enlightenment /Peak Stage | Tajalli (unveiling of Divine Light; Nafs Mutma'innah) | Self- Realization (psychic wholeness) | Inner tranquillity, spiritual maturity, self-integrity | Activities such as <i>dhikr</i> , contemplation, and spiritual meditation; integration of spiritual intelligence assessments |
| Ultimate Goal | Ma'rifah and Qalb- centered inner well- being | Self-wholeness and full psychic integration | Union of conscious and unconscious dimensions | Islamic Religious Education becomes a process of inner transformation, not merely knowledge transmission |

CONCLUSION

This comparative theoretical study has formulated an Integrative Tazkiyah-Individuation Learning Psychology Model that unites al-Ghazali's Islamic psychospiritual framework with Jung's psychodynamic theory. The study identifies clear functional correspondences Nafs Ammārah with the Shadow, the Qalb with the Self, and the processes of Takhalli, Tahalli, and Tajalli with the major stages of Individuation. These findings offer a structured framework for Islamic Religious Education that shifts the focus from cognitive learning to measurable inner transformation. The model's main contribution lies in its practical applicability. While Jungian psychology provides strong diagnostic value but lacks operational methods, al-Ghazali offers concrete practices such as riyadah and mujahadah. Their integration enables educators to guide students through systematic soul development, reinforcing the relevance of Islamic Religious Education for mental health, spiritual well-being, and identity formation. However, the study remains conceptual and literature-based; thus, the proposed model has not been empirically tested. Future research should examine its effectiveness through phenomenological or experimental case studies, particularly within modular Islamic Religious Education curricula or psycho-spiritual counseling services in Islamic educational institutions.

REFERENCES

Ab Ghani, A. J., Bhari, A., Ishak, N. A., Wan Daud, W. N., Bin Tengku Ahmad, T. A. A., & M. Pd.Kons, S. (2024). The Effect of Al-Ghazali Therapeutic

- Consultation Module (KiTA) on Mental Health and Spiritual Intelligence among Students. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 14(11), 2133–2147. https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v14-i11/23540
- Abarchah, M. (2023). "Desindividuation" in Blake's "A Poison Tree": A Jungian Perspective. *Advances in Literary Study*, 11(04), 351–358. https://doi.org/10.4236/als.2023.114024
- Abdullayeva, S. (2024). Jung ve bilinçaltına dair öğretisi. *JOURNAL OF AWARENESS*, 9(4), 357–363. https://doi.org/10.26809/joa.2480
- Acetylena, S., Agustin, E. F., Amrillah, S. F., & Setiawan, E. (2024). Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam Dalam Meningkatkan Karakter Peserta Didik Baru. *Jurnal IHSAN Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 3(1), 424–429. https://doi.org/10.61104/ihsan.v3i1.870
- Albshkar, H. A., Alouzi, K. M., Numan, M., Anuar, K. A. B. A., & Domdom, C. B. (2025). Five Activities to Enhance Spiritual and Emotional Intelligence in International Students. *Journal of International Affairs and Students Mobility*, 1(1), 29–40.
 - https://doi.org/https://jiasmy.intischolar.id/index.php/jiasmy/article/view/3
- Alejandro, A., & Zhao, L. (2024). Multi-Method Qualitative Text and Discourse Analysis: A Methodological Framework. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 30(6), 461–473. https://doi.org/10.1177/10778004231184421
- Ali, N. H. M., Kamaruddin, K., Arsad, S., & Zainal Abidin, L. (2022). Tasawwuf Method Approach Among Muslim Counselors In Kedah. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 12(5), 306–324. https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v12-i5/13285
- Apriyanti, Fadila, Syamsul Rizal, & Rosyada, M. F. (2023). Exploring the Concept of Nafs in Islamic Counseling: A Comprehensive Analysis of Philosophical Foundations and Implications for Education. *HEUTAGOGIA: Journal of Islamic Education*, 3(2), 169–181. https://doi.org/10.14421/hjie.2023.32-03
- Boscaljon, D. (2024). Seeing Jung's Shadow in a New Light: Decolonizing the Undisciplined Depths. Religions, 15(12), 1553. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel15121553
- Breidy, V. (2025). The Role of Knowledge in the Caliphate System of al-Ghazālī: Is It an Element of Openness or Isolating Fundamentalism? *Religions*, 16(6). https://doi.org/10.3390/rel16060765
- Chalhoub, G., Kraemer, M. J., & Flechais, I. (2024). Useful shortcuts: Using design heuristics for consent and permission in smart home devices. *International Journal of Human Computer Studies*, 182, 103177. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhcs.2023.103177
- Cherepanov, I., & Morgunov, G. (2019). Process Of Archetypal Individuation Of Personality. *The European Proceedings of Social & Behavioural Sciences EpSBS*, 2764–2771. https://doi.org/10.15405/epsbs.2019.03.02.322
- Christou, P. A. (2025). Reliability and Validity in Qualitative Research Revisited and the Role of AI. *Qualitative Report*, 30(3), 3306–3314. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2025.7523
- Elzamzamy, K., Bader, R. K., & Bircan, F. B. (2024). Contemporary Scholarship on Classical Islamic Psychology A Scoping Review. *Journal of Muslim Mental Health*, 18(1), 3–45. https://doi.org/10.3998/jmmh.6025
- Engkizar, E., Jaafar, A., Sarianto, D., Ayad, N., Rahman, A., Febriani, A., Oktavia, G., Guspita, R., & Rahman, I. (2024). Analysis of Quran Education Problems in Majority Muslim Countries. *International Journal of Islamic Studies Higher Education*, 3(1), 65–80. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24036/insight.v3i1.209
- Engkizar, E., Jaafar, A., Taufan, M., Rahman, I., Oktavia, G., & Guspita, R. (2023). Quran Teacher: Future Profession or Devotion to the Ummah? *International*

- Journal of Multidisciplinary Research of Higher Education (IJMURHICA), 6(4), 196–210. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24036/ijmurhica.v6i4.321
- Engkizar, Engkizar, Muslim, H., Mulyadi, I., & Putra, Y. A. (2025). Ten Criteria for an Ideal Teacher to Memorize the Quran. *Journal of Theory and Research Memorization Quran*, 1(1), 26–39. https://joqer.intischolar.id/index.php/joqer
- Fadhil, M. Y., & Sebgag, S. (2021). Sufi Approaches to Education: The Epistemology of Imam Al-Ghazali. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(1), 91–107. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v4i1.834
- Fakhruddin, A., Anwar, S., & Fajar Islamy, M. R. (2025). Enhancing academic self-concept and historical literacy in Islamic studies through collaborative learning: a study on prospective Islamic Education teachers in Indonesia. *Cogent Education*, 12(1), 205–215. https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2025.2491871
- Ferhat, L. (2020). Al-Ghazālī's Heart as a Medium of Light: Illumination and the Soteriological Process. *Journal of Islamic Ethics*, 4(1–2), 201–222. https://doi.org/10.1163/24685542-12340050
- Feuillebois-Pierunek, E. (2017). 'Izz al-Dīn Kāshānī and Abū al-Mafākhir Yahyā Bākharzī: Proper Sufi conduct (adab) through the Eyes of Two Persian Authors from Different Brotherhoods in the 13th–14th Century. In *Ethics and Spirituality in Islam* (pp. 449–478). BRILL. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004335134_018
- Fitri, R., Asril, Z., Sabri, A., Remiswal, R., Firdaus, F., & Zalnur, M. (2025). Implementation of Microteaching Based on Self-Directed Learning. *International Journal of Islamic Studies Higher Education*, *4*(1), 68–78. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24036/insight.v4i1.226
- Hamzah, M. I., Fakhruddin, F. M., Mokhtar, M. M., Langputeh, S., & Syafrimen, S. (2025). Six Office of International Affairs Programs to Achieve World Class Universities. *Journal of International Affairs and Students Mobility*, 1(1), 1–16. https://doi.org/https://jiasmy.intischolar.id/index.php/jiasmy/article/view/1
- Hanafie, I., & Khojir, K. (2023). Kurikulum dalam Perspektif Imam al-Ghazali dan Relevansinya dengan Capaian Pembelajaran Mata Pelajaran PAI pada Kurikulum Merdeka. *DAYAH: Journal of Islamic Education*, 6(1), 60. https://doi.org/10.22373/jie.v6i1.15947
- Hossain, U. (2024). 'Navigating the Soul: Unveiling the Depths of Islamic Psychology and its Pathways to Well-being.' *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science*, VIII(IIIS), 4530–4537. https://doi.org/10.47772/IJRISS.2024.803330S
- Htay, S. S., Po, E. T. H., & Kaewkanlaya, P. (2025). Building Student Character through Worship in Elementary Schools. *Muaddib: Journal of Islamic Teaching and Learning*, 1(2), 55–63. https://doi.org/https://muaddib.intischolar.id/index.php/muaddib/article/view/11
- Ismail, M. T., & Haryanto, J. T. (2022). Tazkiyah sebagai Epistemologi Irfani: Perspektif Wahiduddin Khan tentang Spiritualitas Perdamaian. *Jurnal SMART (Studi Masyarakat, Religi, Dan Tradisi)*, 8(1), 49–64. https://doi.org/10.18784/smart.v8i1.1583
- Kermani, N. (2020). Deifying the soul from Ibn Arabi to C.G. Jung. *Journal of Analytical Psychology*, 65(1), 8–26. https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-5922.12563
- Minkov, M., Vignoles, V. L., Welzel, C., Akaliyski, P., Bond, M. H., Kaasa, A., & Smith, P. B. (2024). Comparative Culturology and Cross-Cultural Psychology: How Comparing Societal Cultures Differs From Comparing Individuals' Minds Across Cultures. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 55(2), 164–188. https://doi.org/10.1177/00220221231220027
- Monaro, S., Gullick, J., & West, S. (2022). Qualitative Data Analysis for Health Research: A Step-by-Step Example of Phenomenological Interpretation.

- Qualitative Report, 27(4), 1040–1057. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2022.5249
- Mutholingah, S., & Zain, B. (2021). Metode Penyucian Jiwa (Tazkiyah Al-Nafs) Dan Implikasinya Bagi Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Journal TA'LIMUNA*, 10(1), 69–83. https://doi.org/10.32478/talimuna.v10i1.662
- Ningrum, R. W., & Syafril, S. (2024). Parenting Styles in Gifted and Talented Muslim Families: A Systematic Literature Review. *International Journal of Islamic Studies Higher*Education, 3(2). https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24036/insight.v3i2.203
- Oktavia, G., Burhanuddin, B., Febriani, A., Asril, Z., & Syafril, S. (2025). Analysis of Quran Memorization Methods: Academically Talented Students. *Journal of Theory and Research Memorization Quran*, 1(1), 40–50.
- 'Pandey,' M. P. (2025). Innovative research methods in comparative education: emerging trends and applications. *Discover Education*, 4(1), 210. https://doi.org/10.1007/s44217-025-00616-1
- Paul, F. A., Singh, A., Kalyani, V., & Ali, A. (2025). Soulful sexual health for Muslims: a developmental approach for individuals and clinicians. In *Psychology & Sexuality* (Vol. 3, pp. 1–3). https://doi.org/10.1080/19419899.2025.2584131
- Petric, D. (2023). Psychological Archetypes. *Open Journal of Medical Psychology*, 12(01), 1–16. https://doi.org/10.4236/ojmp.2023.121001
- Rahawarin, Y., Pelupessy, P. J., Haulusy, R. R., & Talaperuw, J. (2025). Millennial Generation's Perception of Larwul Ngabal Customary Law on Dula Island Tual City. *Multidisciplinary Journal of Thought and Research*, 1(2), 1–12. https://mujoter.intischolar.id/index.php/mujoter/article/view/12
- Rahmadi, M. A. (2022). Theory of Mind on Ghazali and Ibn Qayyim Al Jauzi Perspective: Analysis Model on Islamic Psychology. *Psychosophia: Journal of Psychology,* Religion, and Humanity, 4(2), 80–93. https://doi.org/10.32923/psc.v4i2.2500
- Rahman, F. A., Ulwi, K., & Aminudin, W. S. A. B. W. (2025). The Role of Islamic Education in Realizing in Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs 3). *Muaddib: Journal of Islamic Teaching and Learning*, 1(2), 12–23. https://doi.org/https://muaddib.intischolar.id/index.php/muaddib/article/view/7
- Rothman, A., & Coyle, A. (2020). Conceptualizing an Islamic psychotherapy: A grounded theory study. *Spirituality in Clinical Practice*, 7(3), 197–213. https://doi.org/10.1037/scp0000219
- Sari, M. I., Marjani, G. I., Ratnasari, J., & Khairunnisa, K. A. (2023). Robert Frager's Perception of Qalb with Sigmund Freud's Psychoanalytic Theory (Comparative Study). *Jurnal Riset Agama*, 3(1), 101–115. https://doi.org/10.15575/jra.v3i1.19579
- Sari, P. I., Tita, E. I., & Albizar, . A. (2025). Eight Concepts and Practices: Buying and Selling in Islam. *Multidisciplinary Journal of Thought and Research*, 1(2), 38–54. https://mujoter.intischolar.id/index.php/mujoter/article/view/1
- Scalabrini, A., Mucci, C., & Northoff, G. (2022). The nested hierarchy of self and its trauma: In search for a synchronic dynamic and topographical re-organization. Frontiers in Human Neuroscience, 16. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnhum.2022.980353
- Siregar, P., Nurihsan, J., Yusuf, S., & Budiman, N. (2024). Imam al-Ghazali's Concept of Religious Counseling in Forming Moderate Attitudes. *Madania: Jurnal Kajian Keislaman*, 28(1), 103. https://doi.org/10.29300/madania.v28i1.4440
- Sismanto, S. (2022). Model Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam Multikultural. *Al-Rabwah*, 16(01), 32–41. https://doi.org/10.55799/jalr.v16i01.166

- Sun, H., & Kim, E. (2024). Archetype symbols and altered consciousness: a study of shamanic rituals in the context of Jungian psychology. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 15(May), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2024.1379391
- Sunarno, S., Supratna, H., Subandiyah, H., Pairin, U., Darni, D., & Suhartono, S. (2022). The Path of Sufism in the Novel Sastra Jendra Hayuningrat Pangruwating Diyu by Agus Sunyoto: a Psychosufistic Study. *Proceedings of the 1st Konferensi Internasional Berbahasa Indonesia Universitas Indraprasta PGRI, KIBAR 2020, 28 October 2020, Jakarta, Indonesia*, 6–11. https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.28-10-2020.2315321
- Thoha, M. A., Hasibuan, Z. A., & Ardianti, S. (2023). Studi Literatur: Tafakkur dan Syukur dalam Kehidupan. *Anwarul*, 3(5), 856–866. https://doi.org/10.58578/anwarul.v3i5.1403
- Trimulyaningsih, N., Subandi, M. A., & Yuniarti, K. W. (2024). The process of spiritual transformatioto attain Nafs al-muṭma'innah in Islamic psychology. HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies, 80(1), 1–9. https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v80i1.8526
- Uddin, F., & Irshad, E. (2022). Sufism, Religiosity, Life Satisfaction, Hope and Optimism: A Comparative Study of the Disciples and Non-Disciples. *International Journal of Psychological and Behavioural Research (Ijpbr)*, 2(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.37605/ijpbr.v2i1.11
- Voon, S. P., Lau, P. L., Leong, K. E., & Jaafar, J. L. S. (2022). Self-Compassion and Psychological Well-Being Among Malaysian Counselors: The Mediating Role of Resilience. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 31(4), 475–488. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-021-00590-w
- Wahid, A., Karneli, Y., Solfema, S., & Qorib, F. (2025). Al-Ghazali's Psycho-Spiritual Counseling Theory: Guidance and Counseling from the Perspective of Islamic Philosophers. *Al-Musyrif: Jurnal Bimbingan Dan Konseling Islam*, 8(1), 1–11. https://doi.org/10.38073/almusyrif.v8i1.2325
- Wan Nailah, Abdullah Syahiza, A., Hasnisah, H., & Rahayati, Ahmad Muhammad, A. (2023). Influence of Psychological Well-Being and School Factors on Delinquency, During the Covid-19 Period Among Secondary School Students in Selected Schools in Nakuru County: Kenya. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science (IJRISS)*, VII(2454), 1175–1189. https://doi.org/10.47772/IJRISS
- Zalnur, M., Japeri, J., Jaafar, A., & Thuwaiba, T. (2024). The Effects of Parenting in Family of Jama'ah Tabligh toward Children's Social Quotinent. *International Journal of Islamic Studies Higher Education*, 3(1), 1–21. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24036/insight.v3i1.158
- Zulkipli, S. N., Suliaman, I., Zainal Abidin, M. S., Anas, N., & Che Ahmat, A. (2022). The Development Theory of Al-'Aql, Al-Qalb and al-Nafs in Islamic Psychotherapy. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 12(11), 2432–2449. https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v12-i11/15013

Copyright holder:

© Syawaldi, S., Charles, C.

First publication right: El-Rusyd

This article is licensed under:

CC-BY-SA